



These Terms of Use govern current reports published by Muddy Waters Research and supersede any prior Terms of Use for older reports of Muddy Waters Research, which you may download from the Muddy Waters Research's website.

The reports on this website have been prepared by Muddy Waters Capital LLC ("Muddy Waters Capital"). We refer to Muddy Waters Research and Muddy Waters Capital collectively as "Muddy Waters" and individually these entities are referred to as a "Muddy Waters Entity". You should assume that, as of the publication date of a Muddy Waters report, Muddy Waters Related Persons (possibly along with or through its members, partners, affiliates, employees, and/or consultants), Muddy Waters Related Persons clients and/or investors and/or their clients and/or investors have a short position in one or more of the securities of a Covered Issuer (and/or options, swaps, and other derivatives related to one or more of these securities), and therefore stand to realize significant gains in the event that the prices of either equity or debt securities of a Covered Issuer decline or appreciate. Muddy Waters Research, Muddy Waters Capital and/or the Muddy Waters Related Persons intend to continue transacting in the securities of Covered Issuers for an indefinite period after an initial report on a Covered Person, and such person may be long, short, or neutral at any time hereafter regardless of their initial position and views as stated in the research report published by Muddy Waters Research or Muddy Waters Research nor Muddy Waters Research nor Muddy Waters Capital will update any report or information on its website to reflect changes in positions that may be held by a Muddy Waters Related Person. Each report specifies the publisher and owner of that report. All reports are for informational purposes only. Under no circumstances should any of these reports or any information herein be construed as investment advice, or as an offer to sell or the solicitation of an offer to buy any securities or other financial instruments.

Muddy Waters Research is an online research publication that produces due diligence-based reports on publicly traded securities, and Muddy Waters Capital LLC is an investment adviser registered with the U.S. Securities and Exchange Commission. The reports are the property of the applicable Muddy Waters Entity that published that report. This website is owned by Muddy Waters Research. The opinions, information and reports set forth herein are solely attributable to the applicable Muddy Waters Entity and are not attributable to any Muddy Waters Related Person (defined below) (other than the applicable Muddy Waters Entity).

By downloading from, or viewing material on this website, you agree to the following Terms of Use. You agree that use of the research on this website is at your own risk. You (or any person you are acting as agent for) agree to hold harmless Muddy Waters Research, Muddy Waters Capital and its affiliates and related parties, including, but not limited to any principals, officers, directors, employees, members, clients, investors, consultants and agents (collectively, the "Muddy Waters Related Persons") for any direct or indirect losses (including trading losses) attributable to any information on this website or in a research report. You further agree to do your own research and due diligence before making any investment decision with respect to securities of the issuers covered herein (each, a "Covered Issuer") or any other financial instruments that reference the Covered Issuer or any securities issued by the Covered Issuer. You represent that you have sufficient investment sophistication to critically assess the information, analysis and opinion on this website. You further agree that you will not communicate the contents of reports and other materials on this site to any other person unless that person has agreed to be bound by these Terms of Use. If you access this website, download or receive the contents of reports or other materials on this website as an agent for any other person, you are binding your principal to these same Terms of Use.

This is not an offer to sell or a solicitation of an offer to buy any security. Neither Muddy Waters Research nor any Muddy Waters Related Person (including Muddy Waters Capital) are offering, selling or buying any security to or from any person through this website or reports on this website. Muddy Waters Research is affiliated with Muddy Waters Capital. Muddy Waters Capital is an investment adviser with the U.S. Securities and Exchange Commission and is not registered as investment adviser in any other jurisdiction. Muddy Waters Capital does not render investment advice to anyone unless it has an investment adviser-client relationship with that person evidenced in writing. You understand and agree that Muddy Waters Capital does not have any investment advisory relationship with you or does not owe fiduciary duties to you. Giving investment advice requires knowledge of your financial situation, investment objectives, and risk tolerance, and Muddy Waters Capital has no such knowledge about you.

If you are in the United Kingdom, you confirm that you are accessing research and materials as or on behalf of: (a) an investment professional falling within Article 19 of the Financial Services and Markets Act 2000 (Financial Promotion) Order 2005 (the "FPO"); or (b) high net worth entity falling within Article 49 of the FPO (each a "Permitted Recipient"). In relation to the United Kingdom, the research and materials on this website are being issued only to, and are directed only at, persons who are Permitted Recipients and, without prejudice to any other restrictions or warnings set out in these Terms of Use, persons who are not Permitted Recipients must not act or rely on the information contained in any of the research or materials on this website.

The research and reports presented on this website express the opinion of the applicable Muddy Waters Entity only. Reports are based on generally available information, field research, inferences and deductions through the applicable Muddy Waters Entity's due diligence and analytical process. To the best of the applicable Muddy Waters Entity's ability and belief, all information contained herein is accurate and reliable, and has been obtained from public sources that the applicable Muddy Waters Entity believe to be accurate and reliable, and who are not insiders or connected persons of the Covered Issuers or who may otherwise owe a fiduciary duty, duty of confidentiality or any other duty to the Covered Issuer (directly or indirectly). However, such information is presented "as is," without warranty of any kind, whether express or implied. With respect to their respective research reports, Muddy Waters Research and Muddy Waters Capital makes no representation, express or implied, as to the accuracy, timeliness, or completeness of any such information or with regard to the results to be obtained from its use. Further, any report on this site contains a very large measure of analysis and opinion. All expressions of opinion are subject to change without notice, and neither Muddy Waters Research nor Muddy Waters Capital undertakes to update or supplement any reports or any of the information, analysis and opinion contained in them.

In no event shall Muddy Waters Research, Muddy Waters Capital or any Muddy Waters Related Persons be liable for any claims, losses, costs or damages of any kind, including direct, indirect, punitive, exemplary, incidental, special or, consequential damages, arising out of or in any way connected with any information on this website. This limitation of liability applies regardless of any negligence or gross negligence of Muddy Waters Research, Muddy Waters Capital or any Muddy Waters Related Persons. You accept all risks in relying on the information on this website.

You agree that the information on this website is copyrighted, and you therefore agree not to distribute this information (whether the downloaded file, copies / images / reproductions, or the link to these files) in any manner other than by providing the following link: http://www.muddywatersresearch.com/research/. If you have obtained research published by Muddy Waters Research or Muddy Waters Capital in any manner other than by download from that link, you may not read such research without going to that link and agreeing to the Terms of Use. You further agree that any dispute between you and Muddy Waters Research and its affiliates arising from or related to this report and / or the Muddy Waters Research website or viewing the material hereon shall be governed by the laws of the State of California, without regard to any conflict of law provisions. You knowingly and independently agree to submit to the personal and exclusive jurisdiction of the state and federal courts located in San Francisco, California and waive your right to any other jurisdiction or applicable law, given that Muddy Waters Research and its affiliates are based in San Francisco, California. The failure of Muddy Waters Research or Muddy Waters Capital to exercise or enforce any right or provision of these Terms of Use shall not constitute a waiver of this right or provision. You agree that each Muddy Waters Related Person is a third-party beneficiary to these Terms of Use. If any provision of these Terms of Use is found by a court of competent jurisdiction to be invalid, the parties nevertheless agree that the court should endeavor to give effect to the parties' intentions as reflected in the provision and rule that the other provisions of these Terms of Use remain in full force and effect, in particular as to this governing law and jurisdiction provision. You agree that regardless of any statute or law to the contrary, any claim or cause of action, or such claim or cause of action be forever barred.

# **GSX: Small Classes, Big Lies**

On May 18<sup>th</sup>, we published our research on GSX in which we concluded that at least 70% of GSX's purported users are fraudulent, and quite likely the real percentage of fake users is over 80%. We detailed three behaviors we were highly confident evidenced widespread bot usage: "Precise Joiners", "GSX IP Joiners", and "Burst Joiners". A fourth pattern "Early Joiners" is highly likely indicative of bots. A former GSX manager corroborated our conclusions, and even detailed how GSX's bot operations work.<sup>1</sup>

GSX's responses since consist largely of drivel, designed to obfuscate and lie. We maintain our view that GSX is a massive fraud - i.e., it is a nearly empty box. Making GSX's denials even more farcical is that it openly recruits engineers to help it run bot farms, which we show in this report.

#### **GSX** Gives the Finger to its Investors

GSX actually published two responses (of which we are aware) to our report. The first was a non-substantive press release in English.<sup>2</sup> GSX however released a more detailed response in Chinese through WeChat, which we suspect very few U.S. investors use.<sup>3,4</sup> These responses clearly seem intended to deceive.

GSX's WeChat response contains techno-drivel, and appears intended to appear authoritative when it includes the below screen shot of GSX's purported queries to analyze Precise Joiners and Burst Joiners. However, the screenshot prima facie shows GSX is obfuscating its presentation. It omits three important fields: "agent\_id", "agent\_policy", and the crucial "timestamp". The timestamp field is a significant omission that prevents further analysis based on *when* GSX's class switch message was sent. Therefore, this is not usable data. Investors need look no further to know GSX is screwing with them.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> See Muddy Waters' May 18, 2020 report, pp. 10-13.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> https://www.prnewswire.com/news-releases/gsx-refutes-muddy-waters-researchs-allegations-301061639.html

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> WeChat is primarily used by Chinese speaking users. It is largely a chat and news forum and a site for unvetted blogs, posts, news, links. The selection for this channel for the more detailed reply appears intended to help Chairman Larry Chen protect his personal reputation in China, rather than provide more or useful information to international investors and shareholders. The choice of WeChat as the site to release additional details seems to contradict the claim by management in the official response that "GSX is committed to the highest standards of corporate governance, as well as transparent and timely disclosure..."

<sup>4</sup> https://mp.weixin.qq.com/s/8ekeJKN2n8tPXWwP9jxmqg

```
"message_type: user_out", "ts":1589716841, user_id": "37919"}
"message_type":"user_out", "ts":1589716841, "user_id":"50228"
"message_type":"user_out", "ts":1589716842, "user_id":"56105")
"message_type":"user_out", "ts":1589716842, "user_id":"56105")
"class_id": "60050902964181951"
"class_id":"60050902964181951'
                                                   message_type"
                                                                                             "ts":1589716842, "user_id": "542659678"}
"ts":1589716842, "user_id": "19948910"}
"ts":1589716842, "user_id": "19935050"}
"ts":1589716842, "user_id": "553419035"}
 "class_id":"60050902964181951"
"class_id":"60050902964181951"
                                                                                                                                                                      "agent id"
                                                                                                                                                                      "agent_policy"
"class_id"
                                                  "message_type":"user_out"
["class_id":"60050902964181951"
["class_id":"60050902964181951"
                                                                                                                                                                      "group id'
                                                   "message_type"
                                                                          "user_out"
                                                                                                                                                                      "message_type": "class_switch"
"offset_timestamp"
 "class_id":"60050902964181951"
"class_id":"60050902964181951"
                                                   'message_type":
                                                                                                    :1589716842,"user_id":"19933
                                                                                             'ts":1589716842, "user_id":"57653"}
                                                                           "user out
                                                                                                                                                                      "target_class_id
                                                     message_type"
                                                                                                                                                                      "target_group_id"
"class_id":"60050902964181951"
                                                                                                                                                                     timestamp"
"user_id"
                                                   "message_type"
"message_type"
                                                                           "user_out'
                                                                                                    :1589716842, "user_id": "37931"}
 class_id":"60050902964181951'
class_id":"60050902964181951'
                                                                                             'ts":1589716842, "user_id":"19954883")
'ts":1589716842, "user_id":"19950977"}
'ts":1589716842, "user_id":"19999445"}
                                                                            user_out
                                                                            user out
                                                    message_type"
                                                                                             'ts":1589716842,"user_id":"41945"}
'ts":1589716842,"user_id":"591144274"}
 class_id":"60050902964181951'
                                                   'message_type":
 'class_id":"60050902964181951"
                                                   message_type"
                                                                            user_out"
["class_id":"60050902964181951"
["class_id":"60050902964181951"
                                                                                             ts":1589716842,"user_id":"58013"}
                                                                                                    :1589716842, "user_id": "19980146"}
                                                   message_type"
                                                                           user_out'
["class_id":"60050902964181951"
["class_id":"60050902964181951"
                                                                                             "ts":1589716842,"user_id":"46859"}
"ts":1589716842,"user_id":"19960358"}
                                                   'message_type":
                                                   'message_type"
                                                                           "user_out'
["class_id":"60050902964181951'
["class_id":"60050902964181951'
                                                                                                    1589716842, "user_id": "25553"]
                                                                                                                                                                         GSX data missing 'agent_id',
                                                    message_type"
                                                   "message_type":
"message_type":
                                                                                                   :1589716843. "user_id": "45908"
                                                                          "user_out"
                                                                                                                                                                            'agent_policy' and crucial
["class_id":"60050902964181951"
["class_id":"60050902964181951"
                                                                                           , "ts":1589716843, "user_id":"44033"}
, "ts":1589716843, "user_id":"624660723"}
                                                                                                                                                                                   'timestamp' field.
                                                  "message_type"
                                                                          "user_out"
 "class_id":"60050902964181951"
"class_id":"60050902964181951"
                                                                                                    1589716843, "user_id": "19969610
                                                    message_type"
                                                  "message_type":
"message_type":
                                                                           "user out"
                                                                                             'ts":1589716843, "user_id": "19968710'
 'class_id":"60050902964181951",
'class_id":"60050902964181951",
                                                                                            "ts":1589716843, "user_id":"19714349'
"ts":1589716843, "user_id":"19958021'
                                                                            user_out
                                                    message_type"
 "class_id":"60050902964181951"
"class_id":"60050902964181951"
                  "60050902964181951"
                                                                                             "ts":1589716843,"user_id":"19972079"]
"ts":1589716843,"user_id":"57581"}
                                                   message_type"
  class_id":"60050902964181951'
                                                                                                    1589716843,
"class_id":"60050902964181951"
                                                   message_type"
                                                                                                    1589716843, "user_id"
                                                                           "user_out"
 'class_id":"60050902964181951"
'class_id":"60050902964181951"
                                                   'message_type":"user_out
                                                                           user out
```

#### **Response to GSX IP Joiners**

GSX's response to the GSX IP Joiner analysis strikes us as a bald face lie.

In our report, we discussed how we had analyzed 463,217 sign in records for 54,065 unique users. We were able to identify GSX employees (teachers and tutors) in the data, based on how GSX coded them. What we then found was damning – 28.2% of purported students shared an IP address at one point with GSX tutors or teachers. This amounted to 15,239 purported students. With no physical school or learning center locations, we believe this is convincing evidence of significant bot usage.

GSX responded by purportedly querying its entire database to find overlaps between GSX teacher / tutor IPs and students. In the press release, GSX claimed that only 0.78% of students have an overlapping IP. The WeChat response shows these purported query results, with 43,843 overlapping IPs.

student_ips	union_ips	union_pct
5617835	43843	0.007804251993873084

This purported query fails our laugh test. Our data set of 165,111 total distinct IP addresses was only 2.9% of GSX's claimed query data set, yet it yielded 34.8% of GSX purported overlap number. We cannot remotely believe GSX's claim.

## **Response to Precise and Burst Joiners**

In our report, we explained that 10.6% of users joined on the same second, the same day of the week, but on different weeks. We analogized that phenomenon to a weekly flight between two cities touching down at exactly the same second on two occasions. We also explained a common phenomenon (Burst Joiners) in which large groups of users (e.g., 20 or 30) join within the same second. We excluded bursts that occurred within five minutes before to five minutes after the start of classes.

GSX's response to these joining patters is inadequate. It claimed that both phenomena are caused by switching of small class groups led by tutors over to the large class. However, this does not explain the Burst Joiner phenomenon because we excluded bursts within five minutes on either side of the start of class. (Recall that GSX omitted the timestamp from the screenshot above where GSX purported to show the switching is based on this signal.)

GSX's claim that switching from the small classes to the large explains Precise Joiners is also inadequate. In the WeChat response, GSX stated that if a tutor has not switched the small class over by the start time of the large class, the system will automatically perform the switch. However, only 5,742 unique users were Precise Joiners, which was 10.6% of the sample. GSX states that such small class to large class switches are "typical", and that there is an automatic switch for tutors that fail to switch by the class start time. If that were the case, then we would expect to find far more than 10.6% of the sample being Precise Joiners. This explanation again falls short in explaining an observed phenomenon.

### **GSX Openly Recruits for Bot Operators**

GSX's use of bots is so pervasive that it even openly recruits for engineers to develop and maintain its bot army. The images below are of recent job postings. The first is for a GSX "server room operation and maintenance engineer." This post reveals specific details regarding GSX's operations, which is likely the reason it was taken down.

This post was picked up by a user of China's Snowball Finance (雪球) who on May 6<sup>th</sup>, posted the screenshot and asked, "do you understand what this is for?" <sup>6</sup>

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> This excludes the users who were linked to Precise Joiners by IP address or joining at the same second.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> https://xueqiu.com/5346637144/148620489 (underlines added)



Do you understand what this is for? Server Room Operations & Maintenance Engineer GSX, Server Room Operations & Maintenance Supervisor Performance Bonus: 1-4 mos. based on end of yr. salary, varies Responsible for maintaining and operating company's sever rooms. 1. Resolving problems occurring with cell phone equipment in the server room. 2. Cell phone bot network equipment, install all types of framework software like Xp and TaiChi, etc.

3. Huawei servers maintenance and operations.

Xp and TaiChi are ideal for the customized development and operation of complex and secretive bot networks.

- We believe "Xp" refers to Xposed, a set of tools that allows an individual to modify an Android phone or perform tasks on it that it normally cannot when the phone is received out of the box from the manufacturer. When a hacker "jailbreaks" or "roots" a phone, he or she typically wants to install customized software.
- TaiChi: According to its website, TaiChi supports a variety of Xposed modules enabling functions like a "fake device", "fake location", and has the added feature of being "hard to detect."

We found it mildly surprising that considering all the news on GSX and bots, GSX job posts for engineers experienced in the operation and maintenance of large-scale bot networks have not all been taken down. However, because GSX appears so dependent on its bot network to support its fake business, it likely has little choice but to continue recruiting.

Page 5

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup>https://repo.xposed.info/module/de.robv.android.xposed.installer

<sup>8</sup>https://taichi.cool/module/, https://taichi.cool/doc/

Another recent related job post from April 29, 2020 is below.<sup>9</sup> This job post is also seeking cell phone engineers to be responsible for "rooting" or "jail breaking" cell phones, installing new software, and creating bots or fake users.<sup>10</sup>



These job posts also list as one of the top duties of this cell phone engineer the need to be able to set up WeChat accounts and initiate messages. On the surface, this seems ridiculous as nearly all Chinese users with a smart phone know how to do this, even without an engineering background. However, the problem of not just fake students but also fake users in GSX's WeChat groups has been reported by participants. These WeChat groups are formed by the tutor after a class sign up and are intended to engage the family. As with GSX's fake students and fake registrations, it seems management felt compelled to deal with the problem of shortages of real family members in the parent groups through its default SOP; therefore, it called on its robot army and engineers to fill the void.

We expect management will wrack its brain to find another excuse about why it is hiring engineers to run its internal bot network. We thought we would help. Management or IR, please feel free to cut and paste the reply below.

"Muddy Waters does not understand our business or its operating environment. Because bots and fake users are now so prevalent throughout the internet environment in China, we hire and train specialists in bot operations as a matter of quality control. We must build and run these large-scale bot networks internally against our own system to make sure we can effectively block them. We do this to maintain the integrity of the livestreaming classroom and learning environment and provide a safe, "bot free" space where students can learn."

**------**

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> https://www.zhipin.com/job detail/19bacff023f680b71Hd52Ni FFM~.html?sid=seo aladingb, https://www.jobui.com/job/158236612/ Note, the two posts are linked.

<sup>10</sup> Bots and fake users are called "brushing" (刷) in Chinese, this can be thought of as a kind of automatic swiping function in an app, with the result that purchases, reviews, likes, comments or other such fake activities are created.